



Distr.: General 31 July 2014

Original: English

Sixty-ninth session Item 21 (b) of the provisional agenda\* Globalization and interdependence: culture and sustainable development

### Note by the Secretary-General

The Secretary-General hereby transmits the report on culture and sustainable development prepared by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.

\* A/69/150.





## Culture and sustainable development

# **Report of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization**

#### Summary

The present report, prepared in consultation with all relevant stakeholders, describes the progress made in the implementation of General Assembly resolution 68/223. In response to the request of the Assembly in resolution 68/223, a call for contributions was sent to all Member States and to the 15 United Nations organizations working in the field of culture and development. The report refers to the position expressed by a coalition of more than 600 non-governmental organizations, which gathered 1,700 signatories from some 120 countries. As requested by the Assembly, the report also includes options for a consolidated United Nations approach on culture and sustainable development.

### I. Introduction

1. The present report is submitted in accordance with General Assembly resolution 68/223 entitled "Culture and sustainable development", in which the Assembly requested the Secretary-General to submit to it, at its sixty-ninth session, a progress report on the implementation of the resolution, including options for a consolidated United Nations approach on culture and sustainable development. With this aim in mind, a letter was sent to all Member States and a call was widely disseminated to United Nations funds and programmes and the specialized agencies requesting the submission of all relevant information.

2. The report presents information on the progress made at the country and global levels in the implementation of the resolution as reported in the replies received from Member States, United Nations organizations and non-governmental organizations, including. clear options stemming from those contributions on a consolidated United Nations approach on the role of culture for poverty eradication and sustainable development through inclusive economic and social development and environmental sustainability.

### II. Culture for sustainable development

3. The evolution of the concept of development into a multi-faceted model has broadened the development paradigm and paved the way for the acknowledgment of the role of culture. Although the subject of culture was not included in the Millennium Development Goals adopted in 2000, country-level evidence and recognition at the global level have highlighted the role and contribution of culture to sustainable development efforts.

4. The need to better integrate culture into sustainable development strategies was acknowledged by the General Assembly in two consecutive resolutions in 2010 (65/166) and 2011 (66/208). The 2013 ministerial declaration of the high-level segment of the Economic and Social Council stated that: "culture is an essential component of sustainable development; represents a source of identity, innovation and creativity for the individual and community; and is an important factor in building social inclusion and eradicating poverty, providing for economic growth and ownership of development processes." (E/HLS/2013/1).

5. In November 2013, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) launched the *Creative Economy Report: 2013 Special Edition*, which provides additional evidence of the contribution of culture to sustainable development. The report thus builds on key data, such as the study carried out by the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), which highlighted the fact that world trade in creative goods and services totalled a record \$624 billion in 2011, more than doubling since 2002, while growth in the export of creative goods from developing countries averaged 12 per cent annually over the same period. Furthermore, the report introduces the notion that the creative economy goes beyond classical economics to embrace a new paradigm of development that includes social and cultural dimensions.

6. Finalized in 2013, the joint programmes on culture and development that were financed by the UNDP/Spain Millennium Development Goals Achievement Fund,<sup>1</sup> involved 15 United Nations entities, and, with 1.5 million direct beneficiaries, provided tangible demonstration of the contribution of culture to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals.

7. In its resolution 68/223, the General Assembly acknowledged the contribution of culture as both an enabler and driver of the economic, social and environmental dimensions of sustainable development.

8. Echoing this global trend, the United Nations Development Group (UNDG) decided to pursue an inclusive dialogue on the post-2015 development agenda by launching a second phase of global consultations on six themes, among which was the theme "Culture and development". National consultations on the theme have been organized in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Ecuador, Mali, Morocco and Serbia, and a global dialogue has been launched, including an online forum of exchanges with an international call for papers, which will all feed into the global synthesis report of the Secretary-General, which is to be issued by the end of 2014. The UNDG task team for culture and development, established in 2012, has continued to support a comprehensive assessment of the impact of culture on sustainable development and to inform milestone events and processes such as the post-2015 consultations.

9. As mandated by resolution 68/223, a special thematic debate on "Culture and sustainable development in the post-2015 development agenda" was convened at Headquarters in May 2014 by the President of the General Assembly, in partnership with UNESCO. Eighteen Government Ministers and high-level representatives of Member States,<sup>2</sup> the G-77 plus China and the European Union, as well as the Deputy Secretary-General of the United Nations, the Director-General of UNESCO, the Secretary-General of the World Tourism Organization, the President of the General Conference of UNESCO and the Chairperson of the Executive Board of UNESCO, highlighted the paramount importance of integrating culture into the post-2015 development agenda. The segment was complemented by a panel discussion that included the Executive Director of the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat) and the participation of high-level representatives from the World Bank, the International Organization of la Francophonie and civil society, as well as the Special Rapporteur of the Human Rights Council in the field of cultural rights, who highlighted the power of culture for poverty eradication, quality education, human rights, gender equality, sustainable environmental management and more liveable and attractive cities.

10. In May 2014, the global campaign "#culture2015goal", a coalition of more than 600 non-governmental organizations working in the field of culture, published a declaration on the need to include explicit targets and indicators for culture in the sustainable development goals of the post-2015 development agenda. Gathering together 1,700 signatories from some 120 countries, the declaration calls for culture

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> These programmes were implemented in Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Cambodia, China, Costa Rica, Ecuador, Egypt, Ethiopia, Honduras, Mauritania, Morocco, Mozambique, Namibia, Nicaragua, Senegal, Turkey and Uruguay, and in the occupied Palestinian territories.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Albania, Argentina, the Bahamas, Bolivia (Plurinational State of), Bosnia and Herzegovina, Brazil, Cabo Verde, Canada, Côte d'Ivoire, Cuba, Denmark, France, Greece, Haiti, Italy, Jamaica, Mali, Mauritania, Morocco, Paraguay, Peru, Qatar, the Republic of Korea, Serbia, Slovakia, Trinidad and Tobago, Turkey and Viet Nam.

to be placed at the heart of transformative change and highlights the contribution of culture to poverty eradication, education, sustainable cities and human settlements, peaceful and non-violent societies, equality, ecosystems, biodiversity and economic growth.

### III. Progress in the implementation of resolution 68/223

11. In its resolution 68/223 on culture and sustainable development, the General Assembly invited all Member States, United Nations organizations and relevant stakeholders to increase their efforts to implement specific measures to enhance the role of culture. In the following section, the report addresses the implementation of the relevant paragraphs of the resolution.

### A. Promoting cultural diversity through education and the media

12. Increasingly, the role of culture is being taken into account in educational strategies and programmes. Within the framework of its law on intercultural education (2011), Ecuador has developed innovative education programmes, including the teaching of traditional knowledge in higher education and bilingual education for indigenous communities to better prepare them for life in a multicultural society. The United Republic of Tanzania has included the cultural dimension in its primary and secondary school curricula in order to raise awareness of local cultural values, and in Bulgaria, Denmark, Hungary, Slovakia and Togo cultural education was a priority in recent cultural strategies. In the Philippines, the "Schools for Living Traditions" project, an informal educational initiative for the 110 ethno-linguistic groups in the country, addressing the loss of cultural traditions, has helped communities to create a source of livelihood and increased mutual understanding. France, Germany and Japan have promoted understanding of cultural diversity through "Education for Sustainable Development" programmes.

13. Increased attention is being paid to fostering creativity through education. For example: in Ghana, the national education strategy encourages creativity to prepare young people for today's economic and social challenges, Fostering openness to new solutions, inspiring imagination and strengthening readiness to face the unexpected are among the hallmarks of the educational system; the Congo is working with educational institutions to increase the capacities of individuals working in the cultural sector; and France considers the arts and cultural education as a priority in both formal and informal education since it guarantees better participation in social and civic life.

14. Culture and the arts have been supported to expand freedom of expression. Denmark, France, Norway, Sweden and Switzerland all see the role of culture, notably the arts, as a potentially strong agent for change, and see culture, itself as part of an integrated civil society, which can advance pluralism, openness and respect for human rights. Artists and cultural creators, as well as cultural institutions, as repositories for such artistic expression, receive support in order to encourage their role in fostering free expression and democratic societies.

# **B.** Including culture in social and economic development policies and strategies

15. Although poverty has long been seen in economic terms, it is now recognized that it should not only be measured in terms of material deprivation, but also in terms of a lack of participation in decision-making or restricted access to civic, social and cultural life. Contributions to the present report highlight that culture can address both the economic and social dimensions of poverty, and Member States have integrated culture into social and economic development policies and strategies at all levels.

16. At the regional level, the richness of Africa's culture and its contribution to the world's cultural diversity stand among the four priorities of the New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD). In January 2014, the Community of Latin American and Caribbean States (CELAC) paid special attention to culture through the adoption of its "Havana Declaration" and its "Special declaration on culture as a promoter of human development", both of which recognize that culture must be integrated into all relevant aspects of national development planning processes. The Council of the European Union, under the Presidency of Cyprus, highlighted the cross-cutting nature of culture and the need to mainstream it across sectors. In the context of the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, held in Rio de Janeiro in June 2012, culture and cultural diversity were promoted as key contributors to sustainable development. Ecuador has advanced the need to integrate culture into all development policies since it is essential for guaranteeing quality of life.

17. At the national level, in its 2010 constitution, Kenya fully recognized the country's cultural diversity and its important role for national unity, including. the promotion of linguistic diversity, the right to enjoy culture and the need for State support to promote cultural expression. Under the umbrella of its new constitution, Kenya is working to ensure that culture is mainstreamed throughout social, environmental and economic development policies. Togo has developed a cultural strategy and a 10-year strategy for the promotion of culture which highlight culture as a transversal element for development. It also included culture in its national strategy for accelerated growth and the promotion of employment, considering culture as one of the pillars for the country's development. In a similar fashion, Bulgaria, Canada (the government of the Province of Quebec), the Congo, the Czech Republic, Ecuador, France, Hungary and the United Republic of Tanzania have all integrated culture into development policies and strategies specifically based on the linkages between culture and sustainable development.

18. Increasingly, culture is being considered as part of development aid strategies. The Swedish framework for international aid underlines the need for dynamic and pluralistic societies, and confirms the culture sector — including cultural institutions — as important agents of change for democracy and freedom of expression. It points out the importance of national legislation for a successful safeguarding of cultural diversity, freedom of cultural expression and creation. Denmark's strategy, "The right to art and culture", based on its development cooperation strategy "The right to a better life", aims to combat poverty, strengthen democracy and build peace by promoting the universal realization of the right to enjoy culture and freedom of expression. The French cultural cooperation policy supports cultural diversity and sustainable development through capacity-building and exchanges, including through strengthening management capacities and

policies, the promotion of cultural expressions, the development of medium, small and micro-enterprises, the use of technology and skills transfer. Germany has included sociocultural factors in development strategies and programmes, and the Governments of Andorra, Monaco and Norway have increased their international cooperation activities in the field of culture.

19. An increasing number of Member States are gathering data on the culture sector, notably Georgia, Kenya and Togo. The integration of culture into policies has often been limited by the difficulty in developing comprehensive indicators to measure its direct and indirect impacts. Portugal has initiated a series of studies to identify the specific contributions of culture with regard to the competitiveness and internationalization of its economy, training and employment, territorial development and cohesion, as well as to identify which financial tools and investments are the most suitable. While promoting evidence-based policymaking and strengthening the links between culture, economy, education, research and innovation, the Council of the European Union favours work on cultural statistics. This includes the European Statistical System Network on Culture project, undertaken with Eurostat, which is aimed at improving statistical information on the contribution of culture through adjustments in national statistical systems. CELAC promotes the sharing and exchanging of methodologies that enable a quantitative and qualitative analysis of the real impact of culture on economic and social development.

20. Within the framework of the implementation of the 2005 Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions, UNESCO has developed culture for development indicators as an advocacy and policy tool to assess the multidimensional role of culture in development processes through facts and figures, informing policies and promoting the effective and efficient integration of culture into national development strategies. This set of indicators aims at generating new data and building capacities at the national level to strengthen national statistical and information systems on culture and development and to inform cultural policies for development, while enriching the first culture for development global database. By early 2014, new facts and figures were generated in 11 countries across all regions.

# C. Enabling women and men to equally access, participate and contribute to cultural life

21. Targeted policies have been developed to ensure that women and men equally access, participate and contribute to cultural life. The United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) works to ensure that cultural approaches to development increasingly take changes in social and behavioural dynamics into account. The involvement of men is considered fundamental to enabling change, promoting equality and human rights, fighting gender-based violence and promoting sexual and reproductive health. Programmes also engage men and boys on issues related to gender equality, and religious leaders have been mobilized to advocate an improved response to violence against women and girls. The 2014 UNESCO report on gender equality, heritage and creativity examines the intersection of gender equality and access, contributions and participation in heritage and creativity, while gathering research, statistics and case studies in the field of culture, development and gender equality. With a view of ensuring equal access and participation in cultural life,

France and Togo are applying an integrated approach to gender equality, which includes targeted efforts in the culture sector. Special attention is paid to the inclusion of women in cultural projects, as film directors for instance, and diverse other initiatives have enhanced gender equality in the audiovisual sector.

#### D. Developing a dynamic cultural and creative sector

22. Culture is a powerful resource for poverty eradication, taking into account that the cultural and creative industries are among the most rapidly expanding economic sectors in both industrialized and developing economies. According to the World Bank, culture will help to reduce the percentage of people living on less than \$1.25 a day to 3 per cent by 2030. According to the *Creative Economy Report: 2013 Special Edition*, almost 5 per cent of the gross domestic product (GDP) of Ecuador, 5.7 per cent of the GDP of Bosnia and Herzegovina, 3.4 per cent of the GDP of Colombia and 1.5 per cent of the GDP of Cambodia and Ghana come from private and formal cultural activities. At the core of the creative economy, the cultural and creative industries (audiovisual sector, new media, performing arts, publishing and visual arts) generate a broad range of employment opportunities. In Argentina, some 300,000 people are employed in creative jobs, representing 3.5 per cent of GDP. In Morocco, employment in the publishing and printing sector represents 1.8 per cent of the labour force, with a turnover of more than \$370 million.

23. Due to the strategic importance of the cultural and creative industries, many strategies have been developed and efforts undertaken to promote their role. Burkina Faso's 2015 Accelerated Growth and Sustainable Development Strategy' identifies the cultural and creative industries as a key priority for sustainable development and growth, which resulted in the creation of a special support programme and a directorate for the promotion of cultural and creative industries. Brazil and Brunei Darussalam have created training centres for arts and crafts as drivers for social inclusion, urban revitalization and job creation. China is also placing strong emphasis on culture as a pillar of its development strategy, and the creative industries are considered at the highest political level as a major component in the next chapter of China's rise. In 2013, the Republic of Korea focused policies around the creative economy and cultural enrichment as two engines for the next phase of its economic expansion, based on the belief that creativity will be the basis of development and growth for the rest of the century.

24. The cultural and creative industries are considered as pathways leading to the diversification and expansion of national economies. Many developing economies are challenged by their dependence on primary production, a resource-based sector and a narrow export base, which makes them vulnerable. To address this, Ghana aims to diversify and expand its economy by developing traditional crafts and products that can create a niche market and generate employment, and it also hopes to develop a continental market for its cultural goods. In Mauritius, the national strategy also focuses on creativity for economic growth and diversification. The United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO) is supporting the role of culture in industrial development, innovation and opportunity-driven entrepreneurship. The development of creative assets is an emerging sector in developing countries, and UNIDO is promoting a policy framework for creative industries to build the capacity of entrepreneurs and business service providers. The

World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO) provides assistance to the creative sector by implementing a methodological tool that provides data on the benefits that copyrights bring to society. According to analyses conducted in 42 countries, the contribution of the creative sector to GDP stands at an average of 5.18 per cent, while the employment generated by this sector is 5.35 per cent, confirming the role of the sector as an important driver in terms of job creation and economic growth.

25. Being one of the most resilient economic sectors, there is increasing agreement that investing in culture is essential for a dynamic economy. The *Creative Economy Report: 2013 Special Edition* highlights that a lack of infrastructure adversely affects the expansion of the creative industries. Investment in culture remains a key necessity, which is often neglected in times of economic downturn. Many countries, however, have realized that, in times of economic action plan included culture-based investments, and increased funding for culture and the arts, because its Government believes that it is essential for the economy and for quality of life.

26. In the current era of globalization, innovation has become key to ensure the competitiveness of the economy. Mongolia organized a series of forums with a view to increasing the competitiveness of the cultural industries through efficient production and innovation, based on unique cultural features. A similar approach, combining a focus on traditions and national branding with increased quality and productivity of the creative sector, can also be found in other Member States, including Bulgaria, Ecuador, Georgia, Kuwait, Mauritius and the United Republic of Tanzania. Slovakia is working to strengthen the linkages between the culture sector and digital technologies to ensure the sector's economic relevance. Canada is creating an enabling environment in which creators and cultural entrepreneurs can establish the basis for an innovative and competitive contemporary culture sector by actively exploring the opportunities offered by new technologies, taking full advantage of their benefits and providing the population with access to cultural products, while respecting the rights of their creators.

# E. Actively supporting the emergence of local markets for cultural goods and services

27. There has been increased support for the emergence of local markets for cultural goods and services and the facilitation of legal access to them. UNIDO has responded to requests from Bhutan, China, Egypt, Ethiopia, Nicaragua, Morocco, Pakistan and Peru to enhance capacities in the development of traditional cultural products and services, which require creativity and innovation, with the aim of increasing access to local and international markets. Burkina Faso is preparing decrees to better regulate the cultural goods and services sector, including exports. Denmark, France and the United Republic of Tanzania have enhanced legal access of cultural goods and services to local and international markets. In the United Republic of Tanzania this has resulted in a considerable increase of both production and consumption.

28. Cultural tourism remains one of the strongest sectors of the cultural economy, with over one billion people travelling last year. The World Tourism Organization has signed a cooperation agreement with UNESCO, including an agreement on the Silk Roads Project, which seeks to increase the benefits of sustainable tourism

through cooperation among 31 countries with a shared historic heritage. Cultural itineraries in Andorra were developed as part of the Council of Europe's efforts to promote cross-border cultural routes. Other countries reporting efforts to strengthen the cultural tourism sector, notably through cultural institutions, include Bulgaria, which increased the visibility of museums and movable heritage, including a focus on "forgotten personalities", and Georgia, which promoted cultural tourism by allocating significant resources for museum development. Ecuador increased the economic potential of tourism through increased capacity-building and by establishing dedicated local shops, promoting community-based tourism and setting quality and technical standards for tourism providers.

# F. Preserving traditional knowledge and practices of environmental management

29. Traditional knowledge and local environmental management practices are important for ensuring environmental sustainability. CELAC has recognized the central role of indigenous peoples and local communities in economic, social and environmental development, emphasizing the importance of traditional agricultural practices associated with the right of indigenous communities the use of their own resources. CELAC also focused on local practices for integrated management and access to water for irrigation. Canada established agreements supporting the efforts of aboriginal groups to manage their environment and provided assistance to preserve their cultures, heritage and indigenous languages as living components of contemporary society. Ecuador and Japan also recognize traditional knowledge and management systems for natural areas, and Ecuador recently organized an international symposium, which focused on linkages between traditional knowledge and development, and the role of traditional knowledge for sustaining multicultural States.

30. Traditional knowledge and expressions have been protected as intellectual property. In 2009, WIPO decided that its Intergovernmental Committee on Intellectual Property and Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore should negotiate the effective protection of genetic resources, traditional knowledge and traditional cultural expressions. Technical assistance and awareness-raising initiatives continued to protect and promote traditional knowledge, expressions and cultural heritage. In the context of its Committee on Development and Intellectual Property and its Standing Committee on Copyright and Related Rights, WIPO also targeted legislative and practical measures enhancing access to culture, information, and educational material, for example in Burkina Faso, Kenya and Senegal.

31. Culture can enhance the resilience of communities in terms of sustainable farming and food security, combatting ecological challenges and biodiversity loss and for disaster risk reduction. A broad range of risks affect local communities, and climate change increases their frequency and their impact on the lives of the poorest and most vulnerable. To increase local resilience and to address increasing pressures on natural resources, the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) has continued to build on traditional knowledge and to include indigenous communities in promoting sustainable agriculture practices. FAO focuses on outstanding land-use systems, which are rich in biodiversity, to help communities with their needs and aspirations for food security and sustainable development, and aims to safeguard their livelihoods, agricultural and associated biodiversity,

landscapes, knowledge systems and cultures. In a similar vein, FAO has developed a rights-based approach to address the complex biological, cultural and spiritual perspectives and experiences of some communities.

# G. Promoting global awareness of the linkages between cultural and biological diversity

32. The close relationship between cultural and biological diversity is expressed in Ghana's approach to the use of traditional methods to protect water resources, wetlands and river basins. In Japan, the national biodiversity strategy includes a specific target to promote the use of traditional knowledge related to the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity. In 2013, the government of the Province of Quebec, Canada, adopted guidelines on biodiversity, which recognize the importance of traditional knowledge and local practices. CELAC emphasizes the importance of traditional agricultural practices, associated with the preservation of biodiversity, including through the recovery and production of native seeds. France promotes an integrated approach for the protection of its ecosystems through its regional nature parks, in particular support for the revitalization of traditional agricultural practices.

### H. Protection and preservation of cultural heritage and cultural property: the fight against illicit trafficking in cultural property and the return of cultural property, recognizing the importance of intellectual property rights

33. International cultural conventions have continued to assist Member States in protecting and safeguarding heritage in all its forms. Safeguarding cultural heritage is a challenge everywhere, and has different implications from one country to another, depending on social and economic factors.

34. The UNESCO Convention on the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972) is one of the most universally supported international treaties, with 191 States parties. Building on the event for the fortieth anniversary of its adoption, on the theme "World Heritage and Sustainable Development: the Role of Local Communities in the Management of UNESCO Designated Sites" (November 2012, Japan), the convention has been emphasizing a holistic view of world heritage, linking it to the role of local communities in its management and protection, issues of ecosystem sustainability, and the maintenance of biological, linguistic and cultural diversity. The UNESCO recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape integrates the cultural, social, environmental, economic and political components into innovative urban conservation policies. Since its adoption in 2011, it has allowed for the improvement of the state of conservation of urban sites inscribed on the World Heritage List (within which they are the most represented sites category) and provided specific guidelines in view of potential new inscriptions.

35. The UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003), already ratified by 160 countries, has put in place a global capacity-building strategy to assist States parties in creating institutional and professional environments favourable to the sustainable safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage. More than 60 countries have benefitted from comprehensive multi-

year projects, helping them to better integrate intangible cultural heritage into their development policies. On the occasion of the tenth anniversary of the Convention, at the Chengdu International Conference on Intangible Cultural Heritage, held in China in June 2013, more than 300 experts from some 50 countries adopted recommendations calling upon the international community to renew its commitment to the Convention's fundamental premise that intangible cultural heritage is a guarantee of sustainable development.

36. The implementation of these conventions illustrates the intrinsic relationship between heritage and development and that the active involvement of local communities is an essential prerequisite for its safeguarding.

37. There are continuing efforts to address cultural heritage at risk because of illicit trafficking, including through emergency interventions. The UNESCO Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property (1970) and the International Institute for the Unification of Private Law (UNIDROIT) Convention on Stolen or Illegally Exported Cultural Objects (1995) represent key mechanisms in the fight against illicit traffic of cultural property. On these bases, emergency interventions have been undertaken, for example in Egypt, Mali and the Syrian Arab Republic, when cultural heritage came under threat of illicit export or trade. UNESCO has also issued international trafficking alerts and further developed regional and national capacities. The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) has worked on raising awareness about trafficking of cultural property and in strengthening the crime prevention and criminal justice responses. UNODC convened an open-ended intergovernmental expert meeting on protection against trafficking in cultural property, which finalized guidelines for crime prevention and criminal justice responses. In 2014, the World Tourism Organization, UNESCO and UNODC jointly launched a global campaign to raise awareness among tourists of the crime of trafficking in cultural artefacts.

#### I. Develop innovative mechanisms of financing for culture

38. Innovative mechanisms of financing and investing in the culture sector are being developed to further enhance the vitality of the sector and harness its full potential for contributing to sustainable development. According to several Member States, culture has long been underfunded and new approaches are needed. Increased focus on public-private partnerships has thus been fostered, including in Benin, France and Kuwait.

39. Under French law, 1 per cent of the costs of public works are to be invested in public art as a means of enhancing public acceptance of new buildings. France has also established innovative financing mechanisms to support environmental sustainability and combat climate change, including solidarity taxes on air tickets and financial transactions. Such mechanisms could serve as models to finance the safeguarding and promotion of culture, notably the safeguarding of natural heritage, traditional knowledge and biodiversity. Portugal has developed a strategy on culture and economic development, including studies on the creation of financial instruments and on the role of culture in the internationalization of the Portuguese economy. Slovakia is implementing innovative financing approaches through an audiovisual fund — a specialized, independent public institution.

# J. Mobilizing culture as a vehicle for tolerance, understanding, peace and reconciliation

40. Heritage sites have continued to suffer considerable damage, and many of them have been or continue to be used for military purposes, their destruction affecting people over the long term, undermining a collective sense of identity and social cohesion and weakening efforts for reconciliation and peace. The sixtieth anniversary of the Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict and its First Protocol (1954) has drawn attention to attacks on cultural heritage, most recently in Libya, Mali and the Syrian Arab Republic. UNESCO is assisting governments to safeguard their important heritage, for example in Mali, where heritage and cultural expressions in the north were deliberately attacked, mausoleums and tombs were destroyed and damaged and more than 4,200 manuscripts were burned. An estimated 90 per cent of over 300,000 manuscripts in the Timbuktu region were saved through their urgent relocation, although concerns about illicit trafficking in the area remain high. Recognizing the key role of culture in addressing the root causes of conflicts, in April 2013, the Security Council adopted resolution 2100 (2013), and included "support for cultural preservation" in the mandate of the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali (MINUSMA).

41. Culture continues to be mobilized as a vehicle to foster tolerance, mutual understanding, peace, reconciliation and reconstruction. In commemoration of the centenary of the First World War, France has been working to promote heritage and archives as a dynamic means of transmitting knowledge to younger generations and of promoting a culture of peace. Interventions supported by Denmark in conflictaffected areas include projects enabling young people to channel their energy into arts and creative activities, support for art and cultural events for traumatized populations trying to re-establish their lives and the creation of cultural meeting places for exchange and dialogue as an alternative to the political arena. In Kenya, traditional institutions such as community council of elders are being mobilized for reconciliation efforts. In the Democratic Republic of the Congo, the Institut National des Arts has continued promoting a culture of peace by organizing a variety of cultural events, and the same is being done in Togo. Sustained government commitment to the arts and culture in Canada helped strengthen communities by bringing people together through art and cultural experiences. In the face of a natural disaster, culture can play an important role in helping communities to deal with the impact of events. After recent natural disasters, such as Typhoon Haiyan, which affected the Philippines in 2013, or following the Haitian earthquake of 2010, affected populations used theatre, dance and music both as mediums of expression and as ways to overcome the trauma of those events.

42. As a bridge-builder, culture plays a strong role in diplomacy and strengthening international relations, and Member States reported on the increasingly strong role of culture in promoting their countries abroad: Mauritius organizes cultural exchange programmes, which provide for exchanges of artists and cultural professionals to help enhance mutual understanding and promote cultural diversity and human rights; Kuwait builds on its cultural heritage to promote the identity of the country through its diplomatic missions; Georgia cooperates with foreign institutions to promote its national culture and organizes Georgian culture days abroad; and Japan has developed a "Cool Japan" policy as its national strategy to

transmit Japanese culture abroad, with a view to attracting greater numbers of foreign visitors.

# IV. Options for a consolidated United Nations approach on culture and sustainable development

43. In its resolution 68/223, the General Assembly requested the Secretary-General to present options for a consolidated United Nations approach on culture and sustainable development. The contributions received confirm the link between culture and the economic, social and environmental dimensions of sustainable development, and provide details on how to integrate culture into sustainable development activities. It should be noted that, as stated by Ecuador and France, culture is a basic component of society, a vital bridge that ensures a connection and a balance between the three pillars of sustainable development. Finland also stressed the overarching role of culture in enhancing the effectiveness of development policies by strengthening stakeholder ownership and contributing to sustainable outcomes.

44. As highlighted in the General Assembly debate, held in New York on 5 May 2014 by the European Union, the Group of 77 and China and the Group of Friends on Culture and Development, a coalition of some 30 countries from all regions chaired by Peru, culture and the diversity of cultural expression should be fully taken into account in future development goals and targets as culture is a pivotal factor for the success and sustainability of development interventions to address global development challenges through its role in economic growth, social cohesion, quality education, environmental sustainability, sustainable cities and inclusive and resilient societies. The Ohrid Regional Strategy for Cultural Cooperation in South-East Europe, adopted in June 2014 by the Ministers of Culture of the countries of South-East Europe, echoes these views.

45. The declaration adopted by the Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Group of 77 and China on the occasion of the fiftieth anniversary of the Group, held in June 2014 in the Plurinational State of Bolivia, recommended that the role of culture be fully taken into account to achieve sustainable development as "development is a comprehensive economic, social, cultural and political process".

#### A. Culture and inclusive economic development

46. Cultural and creative industries should be part of economic growth strategies. Due to their strategic economic importance, and because they require relatively low capital investment and open opportunities to the most vulnerable, Member States such as Brunei Darussalam, Burkina Faso, Canada, China and the Republic of Korea have recognized the importance of making the cultural and creative sectors a key part of their economic growth strategies.

47. Promoting culture and creativity encourages economic innovation, according to France, while at the same time rapid industrialization may put traditional skills and heritage at risk, as was highlighted by Kazakhstan. Ecuador, Mongolia and Slovakia mentioned that strong branding and creativity are essential for a competitive and resilient economy. Culture is a source of creativity and innovation, and the arts and cultural education contribute significantly to increasing creative thinking skills, as reflected by the Congo and Ghana. Culture creates new ways of looking at society's challenges and development trends. It is a testing ground for new opportunities and a space for developing new solutions, which is particularly relevant in complex economic times and rapidly changing technological environments.

48. Access for cultural goods and services to local and international markets should be further enhanced. This would increase the economic contribution of the culture sector while strengthening its role in reducing inequalities, as emphasized by Norway. In addition, experience in a broad range of Member States has shown that grants and support to artists and creators contribute to a stronger market for cultural goods and services and to more balanced local access.

49. Sustainably managed cultural tourism should be pursued to contribute to inclusive growth. Member States, such as Ecuador and France, agreed that cultural tourism helps reduce poverty, create jobs and generate income for local communities, particularly youth and women. Furthermore, it can drive the economy by allowing destinations to become more competitive, raise their international profiles and create linkages to local activities, including crafts. The rapid and continued expansion of cultural tourism reinforces the critical need to manage it in a sustainable manner, and for an active cooperation between the culture and tourism sectors.

50. To reach their full potential, culture and creativity need investment. Culture is an essential foundation for the healthy functioning of society. In times of crisis, culture is often seen as not essential. However, culture is not only a consumer of funds but also a creator of economic value, with a high return on investment. For this reason, Member States such as Canada consider it essential to connect the economic and cultural environments so that the strength of the economy nourishes the culture sector and its full economic potential can be harnessed. Pakistan calls for greater international cooperation in the field of culture, and France and Slovakia among others, put forward the need for effective synergies between public and private investment for the sustainable financing of culture, including cultural institutions, cultural heritage, and cultural and creative industries.

51. The impact of culture should be better quantified to enhance culture's relevance in development policies. CELAC and Member States, including Benin, Georgia, Kenya, Portugal, Pakistan and Togo, emphasized the importance of gathering quantitative data on culture to inform development policies. A continuous mapping exercise to obtain the necessary information about the cultural and creative economy and its specific sectors was highly recommended.

#### **B.** Culture and inclusive social development

52. The sustainability of cities should be guaranteed in the economic, social, environmental and cultural dimensions. With 70 per cent of the world's population expected to live in cities by 2030, sustainable urbanization is a main development challenge. Within the framework of its national strategy for ecological transition, France promotes an interministerial approach to enhancing the role of culture for sustainable urbanization by fostering architectural quality, increased reuse of historic buildings, investment in public art and the training of cultural professionals

on the use of public spaces. Such culture-led redevelopment can help preserve the social fabric, improve economic returns and increase competitiveness, stimulating a diversity of intangible cultural practices and creative expressions.

53. Cultural heritage and cultural and creative industries should form a strategic asset for local development, and promoting the regeneration of historic downtowns and the conservation and adaptive reuse of their cultural heritage assets can improve the liveability of urban areas, as highlighted by Norway. Kazakhstan highlighted the importance of cultural values for sustainable living environments. Cultural and creative industries can also contribute to sustainable urban transition, which allows for the participation of local communities in urban planning. According to the Danish strategy, growing urbanization and poverty eradication efforts have led to an expanding urban middle class, which forms a new group of cultural consumers looking for cultural activities and for job opportunities in creative industries. At the same time, growing demand allows culture to play a stronger role in fostering social cohesion and in the ongoing reformulation of cultural identity within multicultural urban environments. For Tunisia, development priorities focus on supporting cultural public spaces and libraries in order to promote access to culture for all, thereby enhancing social cohesion.

54. Education strategies and programmes that are adapted to cultural contexts and take into account cultural diversity are more likely to be effective in providing quality education and fostering cohesive societies. Culture can play an important role in building confidence and dialogue among multicultural communities. As mentioned in the replies received from Ecuador, Hungary, the Philippines, Oman, Slovakia and the United Republic of Tanzania, education must aim to develop cultural literacy, including by increasing the understanding of local history and equipping young people with the skills to live in a multicultural society. This can be done through "Education for Sustainable Development" programmes, as in France, Germany and Japan. Strategies advanced by Denmark and Togo emphasized the need for education and capacity-building in the culture sector, and Hungary included cultural institutions and the development of information and communications technologies to enhance the role of culture for non-formal and informal learning. It was widely recognized that the way in which people learn, acquire and transmit knowledge is closely linked to their geographical, historical and linguistic backgrounds.

55. For culture to fully contribute to equitable societies, equal access and participation of both men and women must be ensured. Culture can play an important role in promoting gender equality and empowering women. As highlighted by France and Togo, targeted policies should be developed to ensure that there is equality between women and men in access, participation and contribution to cultural life. For example, this can be done by ensuring that development strategies increasingly integrate cultural dimensions in order to challenge and transform gender norms and relations that slow progress towards gender equality.

56. Cultural practitioners and institutions can play an important role in advancing freedom of expression and enhanced governance. As highlighted by France, culture is an important factor in establishing the rule of law. Denmark considers that culture and the arts can be drivers for dialogue, can provide a free space for discussion and the articulation of difficult issues, and that, through the arts, people can address and

resolve their feelings on taboo subjects. Norway, Sweden and Switzerland emphasized that artistic expression and cultural activities effectively contribute to the putting into practice of the right to freedom of expression and to peaceful assembly, where these are challenged. Artists are among the most vibrant, engaged and outspoken stakeholders in society, and their role as critics is often under pressure, because their inspiration is drawn from social issues, drawing attention to challenges and inadequacies. Using metaphors or symbolic means of expression, artists have a unique way to change perceptions. They should be supported in their role as catalysts of social change, contributing to the fight against exclusion and inequality, imagining new ways into the future and restoring hope. Hungary places a particular focus on the role of theatre, which allows for direct confrontation with important social questions. A number of Member States mentioned the importance of cultural institutions as platforms for artists, which should be used as civic spaces for dialogue and social inclusion, helping to reduce violence and increase cohesion.

57. Guaranteeing cultural rights is crucial for forging inclusive and equitable societies, and an effective, people-centred approach to development as prioritized by Ecuador and Switzerland and in the global campaign "#culture2015goal". The Czech Republic focuses on the importance of culture for social integration as well as for the personal development of socially excluded citizens. Cultural rights, namely the rights to freely participate in cultural life, are recognized as fundamental human rights that are indispensable to people's dignity and freedom. Hungary and Norway highlighted the importance of equal access to culture and to participation in cultural life, by eliminating inequalities originating from geographic and sociocultural disadvantages.

58. A strong, free cultural sector is a force for social change, and it plays a central role in nation-building and democratic development. Sweden and Norway highlighted that violations of political rights are often connected to violations of cultural rights, such as the right to speak one's language, as well as being able to express one's cultural identity and the right to the cultural identity one identifies with. The right to practice culture freely and without fear of discrimination or persecution is essential to the development of a democratic society. Benin, France, Kenya, Slovakia and a number of other contributors specifically identified linguistic diversity as an important element in preserving identity.

59. Cultural heritage, as the collective memory of a community, is key to the building of inclusive societies and it should be further enhanced. Contact between the contemporary world and the past is a fundamental factor for the healthy development of societies. Slovakia has highlighted the necessity not only to preserve the past, but also to ensure that it is meaningful for the present: the systematic safeguarding and accessibility of cultural heritage is as important as its presentation in a relevant manner, with the appropriate connection to the contemporary environment.

60. Culture-related programmes can help foster reconciliation and reconstruction, reinforce resilience and build peace by promoting dialogue and diversity of expressions, as raised by the global campaign "#culture2015goal". While acknowledging that cultural diversity often plays a role in conflict, Member States such as France and Ghana stressed the importance of integrating culture in conflict resolution in order to bring lasting solutions. Cultural diversity and heritage are key elements in reconciliation and peacebuilding processes and allow for the recreation

of social links in post-crisis and post-disaster situations. As highlighted by Member States, cultural activities and artistic expression make it possible to start healing the scars of the past and restoring a sense of normalcy and identity. In conflict situations, effective conflict resolution methods often derive from cultural norms and practices. Culture and the arts are repeatedly called upon for trauma relief in both post-conflict and disaster settings, as could was seen in Haiti in 2010 and in the Philippines in 2013.

61. The role of culture should be enhanced as an important tool of diplomacy because of its role in building bridges and bringing communities closer together. Numerous Member States, such as Kuwait, Mauritius, Oman, Slovakia and Togo, referred to the use of culture as a means to help achieve their political and economic objectives abroad. In a globalized world, intercultural exchanges contribute to better understanding among communities and nations and help to eliminate fear of the unknown, promoting respect and tolerance. Promoting cultural pluralism through cultural exchanges with other countries enhances mutual understanding among countries and promotes respect for cultural diversity and universal human rights.

### C. Culture and environmental sustainability

62. Cultural diversity should be protected as a prerequisite for sustainable development. According to Ecuador, cultural diversity is intrinsically linked to biodiversity and the cyclical rhythms of nature, from food to medicine, from management systems to festivals, directly linking the concept that communities have of development to their natural environment. Member States such as the Czech Republic, Mauritius and Norway confirmed that protecting cultural diversity, including biodiversity, has become a key concern amid accelerating globalization. States are not only responsible for protecting cultural rights, they also play an essential role for safeguarding cultural diversity, which includes providing favourable conditions for cultural expression and creativity, and for access to and participation in cultural life. In its response, Germany specifically referred to the inclusion of the safeguarding of cultural diversity and the promotion of cultural development in the principle of sustainability for development.

63. As mentioned by Switzerland, traditional knowledge systems provide valuable insights and tools for tackling ecological challenges and ensuring disaster risk reduction. For this reason, and in order to protect and restore ecosystems and halt biodiversity loss, CELAC and Member States such as Ecuador, Japan and Ghana confirmed that traditional knowledge should be valued and the participation of indigenous communities in decision-making enhanced. Benin stressed the importance of intergenerational dialogue for the transferring of traditional knowledge and skills and that traditional practices and the sustainable use of biological diversity should be fully recognized for a lasting environmental sustainability. Cultures thrive within and can be identified by their ecological and geographical habitats: aspects of the natural environment feature in beliefs, folktales and rituals all over the world. It is essential to recognize our responsibility to safeguard and transfer knowledge to the next generations.

64. Indigenous peoples should play an essential role in the preservation and sustainable use of biological diversity. Following the example of the government of the Province of Quebec, Canada, the adoption of measures to safeguard and recover

the traditional knowledge and wisdom of indigenous peoples should be supported, while their individual and collective rights to such knowledge should be protected. As highlighted by CELAC, it is vital to recognize the indigenous and traditional systems of land tenure and the right of indigenous communities to access to water for irrigation. Supporting the capacity of indigenous communities to manage their environment according to their culture, including aspects of their traditional knowledge, can contribute to environmental sustainability and greater resilience.

### V. Conclusions

65. The implementation of resolution 68/223 has been pursued at the country level by numerous Member States, United Nations organizations and non-governmental organizations. Important steps have been taken to build on culture as an enabler and a driver of sustainable development within the framework of inclusive economic and social development and environmental sustainability.

66. Culture is an enabler, because programmes and strategies relying on cultural heritage and the cultural and creative industries support the concept that there is no "one-size-fits-all" model by incorporating the local context, which, in turn, significantly enhances aid effectiveness. Culture is intrinsically reflected in people's ways of life — the different values, norms, knowledge, skills, individual and collective beliefs that guide individual and collective action. As sustainable development clearly calls for increased ownership and a more people-centred approach, culture should feature at the core of development strategies.

67. Culture is a driver, because culture is also a sector in its own right. Through tangible and intangible heritage, the cultural and creative industries and various forms of artistic expression, culture is a powerful contributor to inclusive social and economic development and environmental protection.

68. Regarding the possible options for a consolidated United Nations approach on culture and sustainable development, the following should be highlighted:

(a) Culture is a proven asset for localizing development approaches and addressing people's need. Integrating culture in development strategies and policies at all levels leads to increased ownership and to more effective and sustainable development outcomes;

(b) The cultural and creative industries, sustainable cultural tourism and the safeguarding of cultural heritage are powerful drivers for poverty reduction, sustainable economic growth and employment;

(c) Education strategies should aim to develop cultural literacy, including an understanding of cultural heritage, and to equip young people with the skills to live in multicultural societies;

(d) A vibrant cultural life, the quality of historic urban environments and the safeguarding of intangible heritage are key for achieving sustainable cities. Culture-led redevelopment of urban areas and public spaces helps preserve the social fabric, attracts investment and improves economic returns; (e) The safeguarding of traditional knowledge and skills is key to environmental sustainability;

(f) As part of fundamental human rights, cultural rights are indispensable to people's dignity and freedom;

(g) Access to and participation in cultural life of all individuals and communities can greatly improve social cohesion and help build peaceful societies.

69. In a forward-looking perspective, contributions to the present report confirmed that, building on the lessons learned from the Millennium Development Goals, the international community should be looking for development strategies that foster effective, transformative change and that rely on culture. In this context, and based on the language of the General Assembly in its resolution 68/223, that "Member States, intergovernmental bodies, organizations of the United Nations system, relevant non-governmental organizations and all other relevant stakeholders give due consideration to culture and sustainable development in the elaboration of the post-2015 development agenda", Member States may wish to fully integrate culture, through cultural heritage and the cultural and creative industries, within the framework of the future system of goals, targets and indicators.